

SOME LATE 4<sup>TH</sup>-CENTURY COMIC FRAGMENTS  
(ANTIPH. FR. 288 = TIMOCL. FR. 41 = ADESP.  
TR. FR. 123A; ANTIPH. FR. 167; ADESP. COM. FR. 149)  
AND ERATOSTHENES OF CYRENE ON DEMOSTHENES

μὰ γῆν, μὰ κρήνας, μὰ ποταμούς, μὰ νάματα

By earth, by springs, by rivers, by streams!

This iambic trimeter line appears to be attributed to Antiphanes (fr. 288) and Timocles (fr. 41) at Pseudo-Plutarch *Lives of the Ten Orators* 845 b, in the course of a brief description of Demosthenes' early career and his occasionally unsuccessful use of excessively lively language:

προελθὼν δὲ πάλιν εἰς τὰς ἐκκλησίας, νεωτερικῶς τινα λέγων  
διεσύρετο, ὥς κωμωδηθῆναι αὐτὸν ὑπ' Ἀντιφάνους καὶ Τιμοκλέ-  
ους· μὰ γῆν, μὰ κρήνας, μὰ ποταμούς, μὰ νάματα· ὁμόςας δὲ  
τοῦτον τὸν τρόπον ἐν τῷ δήμῳ θόρυβον ἐκίνησεν.

And when he came forward again to address assemblies, he was hissed at for making some remarks using innovative language, as a consequence of which he was mocked by Antiphanes and Timocles: “By earth, by springs, by rivers, by streams!”; when he swore an oath of this sort in the course of addressing the people, he produced an uproar.

Plutarch *Demosthenes* 9. 4, citing Demetrius of Phaleron – who was only a generation younger than Demosthenes and must have heard him speak – has a related but slightly different story: Demosthenes actually used the words Pseudo-Plutarch attributes to Antiphanes and Timocles, which were perhaps drawn from a well-known tragedy or satyr-play,<sup>1</sup> and was mocked by the comic poets for his rhetorical tendencies:

---

<sup>1</sup> Thus Fraenkel 1962, 71–75, comparing Ar. *Av.* 194 μὰ γῆν, μὰ παγίδας, μὰ νεφέλας, μὰ δίκτυα, which he takes to be a parody of the line (= adesp. tr. fr. 123 a). Note also Σ<sup>REIT</sup> οὕτω δὲ τὰ προστυχόντα ὅμνουν, μὰ κρήνας, μὰ γῆν, μὰ ποταμούς (“They used to swear this way by random things, ‘By spring, by earth, by rivers!’”), which seems to be referring to the Demosthenes quotation, although how the author of the note knows it – from Plutarch? – is unclear. For the presentation of Demosthenes in 4<sup>th</sup>-century comedy generally, see Erbi 2011 (pp. 169–172 on this fragment).

Ἐρατοσθένης (*FGrH* 241 F 32) μέν φησιν αὐτὸν ἐν τοῖς λόγοις πολλαχοῦ γεγονέναι παράβακχον, ὁ δὲ Φαληρεὺς (*FGrH* 228 F 16) τὸν ἔμμετρον ἐκείνον ὕρκον ὁμόσαι ποτὲ πρὸς τὸν δῆμον ὥσπερ ἐνθουσιῶντα· μὰ γῆν, μὰ κρήνας, μὰ ποταμούς, μὰ νάματα. τῶν δὲ κωμικῶν ὁ μὲν τις αὐτὸν ἀποκαλεῖ ῥωποπερπερήθραν (*adesp. com. fr.* 149. 3), ὁ δὲ παρασκώπτων ὡς χρώμενον τῷ ἀντιθέτῳ φησὶν οὕτως (*Antiph. fr.* 167. 1–2).

(A.) ἀπέλαβεν ὥσπερ ἔλαβεν.

(B.) ᾧγάπησεν ἄν

τὸ ῥήμα τοῦτο παραλαβὼν Δημοσθένης.

Eratosthenes (*FGrH* 241 F 32) says that [Demosthenes] was often something close to a bacchant in his speeches, while [Demetrius] of Phaleron (*FGrH* 228 F 16) claims that he once swore the following metrical oath to the people, as if he were inspired by a god: “By earth, by springs, by rivers, by streams!” One of the comic poets calls him “empty braggart talk” (*adesp. com. fr.* 149. 3), while another makes fun of him for using antithesis and says the following (*Antiph. fr.* 167. 2–3): “(A.) He got it back as he got it. (B.) Demosthenes would be happy to take over this remark”.

Pseudo-Plutarch’s claims can be reconciled with Plutarch’s on the theory that Demosthenes said “By earth, by springs, by rivers, by streams!” and his words (i. e. the words he borrowed from some unknown poet) became notorious enough to be quoted back at him on the comic stage not once but twice. It might just as well be the case, however, that either Pseudo-Plutarch or Plutarch has garbled what he found in what seems to be a common source-document, or that Pseudo-Plutarch has expressed himself poorly but means to say the same thing Plutarch does, which is that Demosthenes (a) made the oath in the Assembly and (b) was mocked by Antiphanes and Timocles, although not necessarily for saying this in particular. The intended sense in Pseudo-Plutarch would then be something like “And when he came forward again to address assemblies, he was hissed at for making some remarks using innovative language – as a consequence of which sort of behavior he was mocked by Antiphanes and Timocles – (what he said was) ‘By earth, by springs, by rivers, by streams!’, and when he swore an oath of this sort when addressing the people, he produced an uproar”, with ὁμόσας δὲ τοῦτον τὸν τρόπον ἐν τῷ δῆμῳ θόρυβον ἐκίνησεν resuming the sense of προελθὼν δὲ πάλιν εἰς τὰς ἐκκλησίας, νεωτερικῶς τινα λέγων διεσύρετο nominally in order to produce greater clarity and coherence of thought.

Plutarch's citation of a late 4<sup>th</sup>-century source for his information lends credence to his representation of the matter over that of Pseudo-Plutarch. Plutarch's reference to Eratosthenes, moreover, makes it likely that all this information, including the references to the comic poets, is drawn from him, particularly since Eratosthenes is also named as a source for the life of Demosthenes at Plu. *Dem.* 30. 1 ~ [Plu.] *Mor.* 847 b = Eratosth. *FGrH* 241 F 31. If so, however, Pseudo-Plutarch's reference to Antiphanes is likely to fr. 167. 2–3, which Plutarch quotes (presumably from Eratosthenes), rather than to Demosthenes' oath. This in turn means that adesp. com. fr. 149 (also quoted by Plutarch, once again presumably from Eratosthenes) ought to be assigned to Timocles, who on this thesis also did not quote Demosthenes' oath but merely mocked Demosthenes' rhetorical style in general.<sup>2</sup> Antiph. fr. 288 and Timocl. fr. 41 (both μὰ γῆν, μὰ κρήνας, μὰ ποταμούς, μὰ νόματα) should accordingly be treated as *dubia* at best.

S. Douglas Olson

*University of Minnesota*

sdouglasolson@gmail.com

### Bibliography

Ed. Fraenkel, *Beobachtungen zu Aristophanes* (Rome 1962).

M. Erbi, "Demostene nella commedia del mezzo", in: M. Tulli (ed.), *L'autore pensoso. Un seminario per Graziano Arrighetti sulla coscienza letteraria dei Greci*, *Ricerche di filologia classica* 6 (Pisa–Rome 2011) 157–190.

The seeming assignment of an iambic trimeter line (= adesp. tr. fr. 123 a) to Antiphanes (fr. 288) and Timocles (fr. 41) at Pseudo-Plutarch *Lives of the Ten Orators* 845 b, in the course of a brief description of Demosthenes' early career, is actually a reference to Antiph. fr. 167. 2–3, on the one hand, and to adesp. com. fr. 149 (which ought to be assigned to Timocles), on the other. Antiph. fr. 288 = Timocl. fr. 41 should thus be regarded as *dubia* at best.

Строка с ямбическим триметром (= adesp. tr. fr. 123a), цитируемая в биографии Демосфена из *Жизнеописаний десяти ораторов* Псевдо-Плутарха (845 b), со ссылкой на комических поэтов Антифана и Тимокла, обычно воспринимается как цитата из этих поэтов, которые будто бы таким образом

<sup>2</sup> For Timocles on Demosthenes, see also fr. 4. 1–2; 12.

пародировали выпренность речи Демосфена, и приводится в собраниях фрагментов как Antiph. fr. 288 и Timocl. fr. 41. В действительности автор биографии в искаженном виде передает то же, что сообщает Плутарх (*Demosth.* 9. 4), опираясь на Эратосфена: этот стих (из трагедии или сатировой драмы) использовался Демосфеном в речах в качестве клятвы, а Антифан и другой, неназванный комический поэт высмеивали его за высокопарный стиль в других стихах, которые тут же цитируются (adesp. com. fr. 149; Antiph. fr. 167. 2–3). Таким образом, Antiph. fr. 288 = Timocl. fr. 41 должны рассматриваться самое большее как *dubia*, при этом adesp. com. fr. 149 следует атрибутировать Тимоклу.

## CONSPECTUS

VIKTORIA T. MUSBAKHOVA	
A Scythian Ares (Aesch. <i>Ch.</i> 161–162)?	181
CARLO M. LUCARINI, MARIA SCERMINO	
Il ruolo di Posidonio e della dossografia per la datazione del <i>Περὶ κόσμου</i> e i rapporti di quest'ultimo con l' <i>Elogium geographiae</i> . I	198
AUDRONĖ KUČINSKIENĖ	
Play on the Meaning of Name in Cicero's <i>Verrines</i> : Some Remarks on <i>Div. Caec.</i> 48–50	229
WJATSCHESLAW K. CHRUSTALJOW	
<i>Sic est (non) iusta causa belli?</i> Issues of Law and Justice in the Debate Concerning a Roman Annexation of Egypt in 65 BC	244
SOFIA EGOROVA	
<i>Novisque rebus infidelis Allobrox</i> (Hor. <i>Epod.</i> 16. 6)	265
DENIS KEYER	
The Train of Thought in Horace, <i>Epist.</i> 2. 2. 213–216	274

## EPIGRAPHICA

NADEZHDA NOVOSELOVA, ANNA NAMOYLIK	
A Chalcedonic Die of Astynomos Ἡράκλειος from Tauric Chersonesus	289
NATALIA PAVLICHENKO, NIKOLAJ FEDOSEEV	
A New Inscription of Herakas, Son of Pontikos, ἀρχερμηγεὺς Ἀλανῶν	315

## COMMENTARII BREVIORES

S. DOUGLAS OLSON	
Some Late 4 <sup>th</sup> -century Comic Fragments (Antiph. fr. 288 = Timocl. fr. 41 = adesp. tr. fr. 123a; Antiph. fr. 167; adesp. com. fr. 149) and Eratosthenes of Cyrene on Demosthenes	339
ЕКАТЕРИНА НОВИКОВА	
De <i>rutilo</i> metri Graeci nomine	343
Keywords	346